

Willatook Wind Farm Proposal Community Engagement Committee

Meeting date Wednesday 9 December 2020

Meeting time and location 3pm, via Zoom

1. Welcome

2. Present

Cr James Purcell
Cr Jim Doukas
Paul Lewis
Ken Johnston
Jay Knight, Senior Development Manager, Wind Prospect (WP)
Tanya Waterson, Wind Prospect

Vicki Askew-Thornton, Moyne Shire

3. Apologies

Graham Keane

4. Declarations of Interest

Nil.

5. Election of Chairperson

Moved Cr Doukas, seconded Paul Lewis that Cr Purcell be elected Chairperson.

CARRIED

6. Confirmation of Minutes of previous meeting

Moved by Cr Doukas, seconded by Ken Johnston that the minutes of the meeting held on 9 August 2020 be confirmed.

CARRIED

7. Business arising from previous Minutes

7.1 Proposal for WP's noise consultant to make a presentation.

Response:

- The design of the turbine layout is being finalised for the EES and planning application processes. Following this, the noise report will be updated by Sonus. It is not appropriate to provide reports to the public whilst the Technical Reference Group (TRG) is still receiving and reviewing the range of reports required for the EES.

- WP is proposing to hold an open day around March 2021, where a Sonus consultant will be present to provide information about the methodology used for the noise assessments and the results.
- Around that time, Sonus could also present to the CEC members regarding the noise assessment methodology and results.

7.2 Questions for Council - *Can decommissioned blades from any constructed Willatook Wind Farm be buried on the wind farm site? Will Moyne Shire make provision for decommissioned wind turbine blades from Moyne Shire wind farms to be disposed of within Moyne Shire and not dumped on others elsewhere?*

Advice from Council's Environment and Regulatory Services directorate is:

- Wind turbine components would be classed as industrial waste.
- There aren't any industrial waste facilities in Moyne Shire Council.
- The EPA is responsible for industrial waste in Victoria.

Cr Doukas will raise this issue with Councillors for discussion.

Council will contact Pacific Hydro to ask how it would be required to dispose of turbine components if it were to dismantle the Codrington and Yambuk Wind Farms in coming years.

Council will contact the EPA for information on where wind turbine components would currently be disposed of.

7.3 WP has provided the CEC with noise contour plots and modelling parameters as requested.

8. Correspondence Incoming

24 August - Noise contour plots and modelling parameters from WP.

4 December - Questions on notice from Neil Blain.

8 December - Willatook Wind Farm Neighbour Benefit Sharing Program information brochure

8 December - Project update from Wind Prospect (Att 1)

9 December – Question on notice from Paul Lewis via email

9 December – Response from WP to questions on notice from Neil Blain (included in General Business)

8. Correspondence Outgoing

Nil.

9. Reports:

9.1 Wind Prospect (WP):

9.1.1 Summary of further discussion regarding the Project Update, Community Benefit Fund and the Neighbour Benefit Sharing Program:

- The Community Benefit Fund and the Neighbour Benefit Sharing Program proposed by WP would take effect if the project receives a planning permit and progresses to operation.
- WP continues to accept feedback on the Neighbour Benefit Sharing Program.
- The program is voluntary and there will not be a legally binding agreement between WP and a dwelling owner. Dwelling owners will need to register and meet eligibility criteria to participate.
- The Program would be available to landholders living within 6km of a turbine.
- When a revised layout is completed next year, WP will be able to provide a map showing how many dwellings are within 2, 4 and 6km of the nearest turbine(s).
- If neighbouring residents have detailed questions about the Neighbour Benefit Sharing Program, they can contact WP directly.
- Decisions on the allocation of funds via the proposed Community Benefit Fund would be done by a fund committee. It is expected the committee would consider the geographical location of applications.
- The proposed number of turbines is up to 86.
- WP took on notice a question from Ken Johnston regarding whether WP would have its noise report independently peer reviewed.

9.1.2 WP took on notice the following question from Paul Lewis:

As you may have seen in windfarm living emails the acousticians Marshall Day are in court proceedings re noise compliance if these acousticians working for wind farm development companies are found to be negligent in their duties how does that affect the indemnities that are offered to turbine hosts and participating landholders?

9.1.3 Concern was raised about the condition of the Woolsthorpe-Heywood Road and its ability in its current state to accommodate project construction traffic. Reference was made to the July 2019 CEC meeting where VicRoads indicated that at that time there had been no budget set aside for an upgrade of that road. Council can confirm that VicRoads is represented on the EES Technical Reference Group.

9.2 Community Members:

Nothing further to add.

9.3 Council:

Council confirmed that the Committee's Charter allows for up to 3 community representatives.

10. General business

10.1 Response from WP to questions on notice from Neil Blain:

Q1) NZS 6808:2010 clause 5.3.1 states that "the wind farm noise limit of 40dB $L_{A90(10 min)}$ is appropriate for the protection of sleep, health and amenity of residents at most noise sensitive locations..."

What does $L_{A90(10 min)}$ mean?

- A-weighted decibels - Decibels with the sound pressure scale adjusted to conform with the frequency response of the human ear. A sound level meter that measures A-weighted decibels has an electrical circuit that allows the meter to have the same sensitivity to sound at different frequencies as the average human ear.
- L90 is a measurement of the sound level (e.g. 40dB) exceeded for 90% of the time. The "L" is for "Level" (i.e. sound level).
- 10 min (minutes) is the period of time that sound is measured.
- Therefore, a wind farm noise limit of 40dB $L_{A90(10\text{ min})}$ means that when noise is measured it would exceed 40dB(A) for 9 minutes (or more) of a 10 minute period (for the average human ear). If it did exceed 40dB(A) for that period (9+ minutes of a 10 minute period), the noise limit would be exceeded.
- The $L_{A90(10\text{ min})}$ descriptor is used for wind farms as it assists in removing the noise from intermittent sources (birds, vehicles wind gusts in trees etc).

Q2) A wind farm noise limit of 40dB $L_{A90(10\text{ min})}$ means that neighbouring residents may still experience wind farm noise levels above 40decibels, while the wind farm is still considered to be compliant according to 40dB $L_{A90(10\text{ min})}$. When noise levels are expressed as 40dB $L_{A90(10\text{ min})}$ it is not a maximum noise limit. Is that correct?

- The answer to question 1 also answers this question, but to be clear, noise levels can exceed 40dB(A) (i.e. 40 A-weighted decibels) for short periods (<9 minutes of any 10 minute interval) at neighbouring residences (outside the residence).
- NZS 6808:2010 states in the foreword at page 7:
 - *Wind Farm sound may be audible at times at noise sensitive locations, and this Standard does not set limits that provide absolute protection for residents from audible wind farm sounds. Guidance is provided on the noise limits that are considered reasonable for protecting sleep and amenity from wind farm sound received at noise sensitive locations.*
- The Standard also states in Section 4.1.2 on page 19:
 - *Land-use planning controls relating to environmental sound attempt to provide a reasonable (not absolute) level of protection for the community's health, well-being, and amenity, and to avoid significant adverse noise effects.*

10.2 The submission of questions on notice from members of the public was discussed. It was agreed that these should to be submitted to the CEC via one of the community representatives who will then email it to Vicki. The item will then be circulated to all CEC members and placed on the next meeting's agenda.

Next meeting – Wednesday 10 March 2021 at 3pm. Venue to be advised.

Confirmed this / /

Chair

Minutes are to be registered in Moyne Shire's electronic document management system by the committee reporting officer immediately following the Minutes' confirmation and signing